

# Rate Optimization and Resource Allocation in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks



*By*  
Bakhtiar Ali  
CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB

PhD Thesis  
In  
Electrical Engineering

COMSATS Institute of Information Technology  
Islamabad - Pakistan

Spring 2017



**COMSATS Institute of Information Technology**

# **Rate Optimization and Resource Allocation in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks**

A Thesis Presented to

**COMSATS Institute of Information Technology**

In partial fulfillment  
of the requirement for the degree of

**PhD (Electrical Engineering)**

By

**Bakhtiar Ali**

**CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB**

**Spring 2017**

# Rate Optimization and Resource Allocation in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks

---

A Post Graduate Thesis submitted to the Department of Electrical Engineering as partial fulfillment of the requirement for the award of Degree of Ph.D (Electrical Engineering).

Name	Registration Number
Bakhtiar Ali	CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB

## Supervisor

Dr. Muhammad Fasih Uddin Butt  
Assistant Professor, Department of Electrical Engineering  
COMSATS Institute of Information Technology (CIIT)  
Islamabad.

## Co-Supervisor

Dr. Soon Xin Ng  
Associate Professor, School of Electronics and Computer Science  
University of Southampton, Southampton, UK.

# Certificate of Approval

This is to certify that the research work presented in this thesis, entitled “Rate Optimization and Resource Allocation in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks” was conducted by Mr. Bakhtiar Ali, under the supervision of Dr. Muhammad Fasih Uddin Butt. No part of this thesis has been submitted anywhere else for any other degree. This thesis is submitted to the Department of Electrical Engineering, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad, in the partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the field of Electrical Engineering.

Student Name: Bakhtiar Ali

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_

## **Examinations Committee:**

.....  
«External Examiner 1:Name»  
(Designation& Office Address)

.....  
«External Examiner 1:Name»  
(Designation& Office Address)

.....  
Dr. M. Fasih Uddin Butt  
Supervisor,  
Department of Electrical Engineering  
CIIT, Islamabad

.....  
Prof. Dr. M. Junaid Mughal  
Chairman/HoD,  
Department of Electrical Engineering  
CIIT, Islamabad

.....  
Prof. Dr. Shahid A. Khan  
Dean, Faculty of Electrical Engineering,  
CIIT

## **Author's Declaration**

I Bakhtiar Ali (Registration No. CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB) hereby state that my PhD thesis titled “Rate Optimization and Resource Allocation in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks” is my own work and has not been submitted previously by me for taking any degree from this University i.e. COMSATS Institute of Information Technology or anywhere else in the country/world.

At any time if my statement is found to be incorrect even after I graduate the University has the right to withdraw my PhD degree.

Date: 11<sup>th</sup> April, 2017

---

**Bakhtiar Ali**  
CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB

# **Plagiarism Undertaking**

I solemnly declare that research work presented in this thesis titled “Rate Optimization and Resource Allocation in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks” is solely my research work with no significant contribution from any other person. Small contributions/help wherever taken has been duly acknowledged and that complete thesis has been written by me.

I understand the zero tolerance policy of HEC and COMSATS Institute of Information Technology towards plagiarism. Therefore, I as an author of the above titled thesis declare that no portion of my thesis has been plagiarized and any material used as reference is properly referred/cited.

I undertake if I am found guilty of any formal plagiarism in the above titled thesis even after award of PhD Degree, the University reserves the right to withdraw/revoke my PhD degree and that HEC and the university has the right to publish my name on the HEC/university website on which names of students are placed who submitted plagiarized thesis.

Date: 11<sup>th</sup> April, 2017

---

**Bakhtiar Ali**

CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB

# Certificate

It is certified that Bakhtiar Ali (Registration No. CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB) has carried out all the work related to this thesis under my supervision at the Department of Electrical Engineering, COMSATS Institute of Information Technology, Islamabad and the work fulfills the requirement for award of PhD degree.

Date: 11<sup>th</sup> April, 2017

Supervisor:

---

Dr. Muhammad Fasih Uddin Butt  
Assistant Professor,  
Department of Electrical Engineering

Head of Department:

---

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Junaid Mughal  
Department of Electrical Engineering

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First and foremost, I would like to thank Allah the Almighty, who has blessed me with all the abilities and support required to carry out my research work.

I acknowledge intimate support of my parents throughout my educational career. Their prayers, moral and financial support always kept me motivated towards my goal. I also appreciate my spouse for her cooperation, love, support and providing stress free atmosphere during my PhD studies.

I am very grateful to my supervisor Dr. Muhammad Fasih Uddin Butt for his support, guidance and encouragement in fulfilling my ambitions. I am also very thankful to my co-supervisor Dr. Soon Xin Ng whose keen observance and directives helped me to develop and enhance my skills and complete my research work in time. His exceptional guidance has always enabled me to get out of difficulties of research work. I am thankful to Miss. Nida Zamir for her collaboration. I also gratefully acknowledge all my former and present colleagues in the Next Generation Communications Research Group for creating such a wonderful work environment.

**Bakhtiar Ali**

**CIIT/SP12-PEE-008/ISB**



# **ABSTRACT**

## **Rate Optimization and Resource Allocation in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks**

Cognitive radio enables the cognitive nodes or Secondary Users (SUs) to sense any opportunity for transmission without degrading the Primary Users (PUs) transmission. This helps in efficient utilization of the available radio spectrum. Cooperation among PUs and SUs can greatly enhance the performance of the cognitive radio network. In this thesis, we have considered various spectrum access strategies in Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks (CCRN) using distributed matching algorithms in order to optimize the PU and/or SU sum-rate. SUs cooperatively relay PUs messages based on Amplify-and-Forward (AF) and Decode-and-Forward (DF) cooperative techniques, in exchange for accessing some of the spectrum for their secondary communications. From the literatures, we found that the Conventional Distributed Algorithm (CDA) and Pragmatic Distributed Algorithm (PDA) aim to maximize the PU sum-rate resulting in a lower sum-rate for the SU. In this contribution, we have investigated a suit of distributed matching algorithms. More specifically, we investigated SU-based CDA (CDA-SU) and SU-based PDA (PDA-SU) that maximize the SU sum-rate. We have also proposed the All User-based PDA (PDA-ALL), for maximizing the sum-rates of both PU and SU groups. All schemes are investigated under the idealistic scenario involving perfect coding and perfect modulation, as well as under practical scenario involving actual coding and actual modulation. Explicitly, our practical scenario considers the adaptive coded modulation based DF schemes for transmission flexibility and efficiency. More specifically, we have considered the Self-Concatenated Convolutional Code (SECCC), which exhibits low complexity, since it invokes only a single encoder and a single decoder. Furthermore, puncturing has been employed for enhancing the bandwidth efficiency of SECCC. As another enhancement, physical layer security has been applied to our system by introducing a unique Advanced Encryption Standard (AES) based puncturing to our SECCC scheme.

Furthermore, we present a secrecy sum-rate maximization based matching algorithm between PUs and SU cooperative jammers in the presence of an eavesdropper. We present the achievable secrecy regions by employing friendly jammers which transmit noise to impair the eavesdropper's ability to decode the message. The cooperative jammers are allocated a fraction of the bandwidth in compensation for their help to transmit jamming signals towards the eavesdropper, which in our case is an untrusted relay node. We provide results for the secrecy rate regions, where we consider only relaying link between the source and the destination. We also provide results for the secrecy rate regions when we consider a direct link between the source and destination in addition to the relaying link. The Conventional Distributed Algorithm (CDA) and the Pragmatic Distributed Algorithm (PDA), which were originally designed for maximizing the user's sum rate, are modified and adapted for maximizing the secrecy sum-rate for the primary user.

In the end we considered a scenario such that a single PU can acquire help from multiple SUs. More explicitly, we consider an untrusted relay scenario, where the relay is a potential eavesdropper. The transmission of the proposed scheme is divided into three time slots, i.e., broadcast and jamming phase, relaying phase and the jammer's secondary transmission phase or utility phase. We employ multiple jammers where we first fix the position of the first jammer at the point where maximum secrecy is achieved and study the behavior of introducing a second jammer to maximize the secrecy further. Then we fix the locations of the first two jammers and add another jammer to assist in improving the secrecy further. We consider a leader-follower game theoretic model where the primary user (source) is the leader and the secondary users (jammers) are the followers. To facilitate the behavior of cooperative jammers, a Nash equilibrium based power control mechanism is employed. We consider two scenarios for our power control mechanism, where in the first case the jammers simultaneously transmit their information (non-orthogonal) during the jammer's utility phase, while in the second case the jammer's utility time slot is divided equally among the participating jammers (orthogonal) to mitigate interference caused by the participating jammers.

## LIST OF PUBLICATIONS

1. **Bakhtiar Ali**, N. Zamir, S. X. Ng and M. F. U. Butt, “Distributed Matching Algorithms for Spectrum Access: A Comparative Study and Further Enhancements”,*KSII Transactions on Internet and Information Systems*, eISSN 1976-7277, [Under review] [Chapter 3].
2. **Bakhtiar Ali**, N. Zamir, S. X. Ng and M. F. U. Butt, “Distributed Matching Algorithms: Maximizing Secrecy in the Presence of Untrusted Relay”,*Radioengineering Journal*, ISSN 1210-2512 [Accepted for publication] [Chapter 4].
3. N. Zamir, **Bakhtiar Ali**, M. F. U. Butt and S. X. Ng, “Further Improving secrecy rate via cooperative jamming based on Nash Equilibrium”,*IEEE Communications Letters*, [Under review] [Chapter 5].
4. **Bakhtiar Ali**, N. Zamir, S. X. Ng and M. F. U. Butt, “Physical layer security: Friendly jamming in an untrusted relay scenario”,*2016 24th European Signal Processing Conference (EUSIPCO)*, Budapest, 2016, pp. 958-962.
5. N. Zamir, **Bakhtiar Ali**, M. F. U. Butt and S. X. Ng, “Improving secrecy rate via cooperative jamming based on Nash Equilibrium”,*2016 24th European Signal Processing Conference (EUSIPCO)*, Budapest, 2016, pp. 235-239.

## **Additional Research Work**

6. J. Mirza, **Bakhtiar Ali**, S. S. Naqvi, S. Saleem, “Hybrid Precoding via Successive Refinement for Millimeter Wave MIMO Communication Systems,”,*in IEEE Communications Letters*, vol.PP, no.99, pp.1-1.
7. H. M. F. A. Madni, **Bakhtiar Ali** and M. F. U. Butt, “Study and Analysis of Channel Estimation Techniques for OFDM Based Wireless Communication Systems”,*2014 12th International Conference on Frontiers of Information Technology*, 2014, pp. 56-60.
8. K. Naveed, **Bakhtiar Ali** and M. T. Akhtar, “A variable step size affine projection algorithm based on the principle of orthogonality,”,*2016 IEEE 59th International Midwest Symposium on Circuits and Systems (MWSCAS)*, Abu Dhabi, 2016, pp. 1-4

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Overview of Cooperative Cognitive Radio Networks . . . . .	2
1.2	Thesis contributions . . . . .	6
1.3	Thesis structure . . . . .	8
<b>2</b>	<b>Background and Literature Survey</b>	<b>11</b>
2.1	Cognitive Radio Networks . . . . .	12
2.1.1	Interweave . . . . .	14
2.1.2	Underlay . . . . .	15
2.1.3	Overlay . . . . .	17
2.2	Cooperative Communications . . . . .	18
2.2.1	Fixed relaying . . . . .	20
2.2.1.1	Amplify and Forward . . . . .	20
2.2.1.2	Decode and Forward . . . . .	20
2.2.1.3	Compress and Forward . . . . .	21
2.2.1.4	Coded Cooperation . . . . .	21
2.2.2	Adaptive Relaying . . . . .	21
2.2.2.1	Selection and Dynamic Relaying . . . . .	21
2.2.2.2	Incremental Relaying . . . . .	22
2.3	Game Theory . . . . .	23
2.3.1	Game Models . . . . .	24
2.3.1.1	Strategic Games . . . . .	24
2.3.1.2	Analyzing Games . . . . .	26
2.3.1.2.1	Pareto optimality . . . . .	26
2.3.1.2.2	Best Response and Nash Equilibrium . . . . .	26
2.3.1.3	Extensive Games . . . . .	27
2.3.1.4	Coalitional Games . . . . .	27
2.3.1.5	Bayesian Games . . . . .	27
2.3.1.6	Repeated Games . . . . .	28
2.4	Literature Review . . . . .	28
2.5	Summary . . . . .	37
<b>3</b>	<b>Distributed Matching Algorithms: Maximizing the Throughput</b>	<b>39</b>
3.1	Introduction . . . . .	40
3.2	System Model . . . . .	44
3.3	The Matching Algorithms . . . . .	46
3.3.1	CDA . . . . .	46
3.3.2	PDA . . . . .	48
3.3.3	CDA-SU . . . . .	51
3.3.4	PDA-SU . . . . .	53
3.3.5	PDA-ALL . . . . .	55
3.3.6	CODING AND MODULATION DESIGN . . . . .	57
3.4	Results . . . . .	61
3.4.1	Performance of the proposed schemes versus the PU-based schemes	61
3.4.2	Performance of PDA-ALL versus PDA and PDA-SU . . . . .	69

3.5 Conclusion . . . . .	69
<b>4 Distributed Matching Algorithms: Maximizing the Secrecy rate using Friendly Jamming</b>	<b>72</b>
4.1 Introduction . . . . .	73
4.2 Friendly Jamming Based PLS . . . . .	76
4.2.1 Cooperative Jamming without S-D Direct Link . . . . .	77
4.2.2 Cooperative Jamming with S-D Direct Link . . . . .	78
4.2.3 Secrecy Regions . . . . .	81
4.3 Game Theoretic Secrecy Maximization . . . . .	84
4.3.1 Secure CDA . . . . .	87
4.3.2 Secure PDA . . . . .	88
4.3.3 Results . . . . .	89
4.4 Conclusion . . . . .	91
<b>5 Distributed Matching Algorithms: Maximizing the Secrecy rate using Multiple Jammers</b>	<b>95</b>
5.0.1 Introduction . . . . .	96
5.1 System Model . . . . .	100
5.1.1 Non-Orthogonal Transmission . . . . .	101
5.1.2 Orthogonal Transmission . . . . .	102
5.2 Results and Discussions . . . . .	108
5.3 Conclusion . . . . .	111
<b>6 Conclusions and future works</b>	<b>116</b>
6.1 Summary and Conclusions . . . . .	117
6.2 Design Guidelines . . . . .	120
6.3 Future Works . . . . .	121
<b>Appendices</b>	<b>125</b>
<b>A Appendix 1</b>	<b>125</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>136</b>